

SYMEON

—— Issue Fourteen ——



An odd item out in a miscellaneous archival series; a name which changes alongside an individual's migration history; a lingering continuity across a transition between historical periods; these common encounters compel us to confront the ambiguous nature of boundaries in the historian's craft. The theme of this year's edition of *Symeon* is 'Crossing Boundaries.' We are proud to present essays from students, staff, and alumni from Durham's Department of History which insightfully examine the making, breaking, and manipulating of boundaries in history and historical practice.



ISAIAH SILVERS Editor-in-Chief

this theme into the twenty-first century, Rachal Limbu analyses the work of the Gurkha Justice Campaign in the wake of the 1997 Hong Kong handover. In her article, we see how Gurkha activists' fight for immigration justice in a specific political context also challenged the long-standing racial underpinnings of empire.

In this edition, we are also pleased to share a report by Sarah Davies from a recent departmental event on careers for postgraduates and early-career historians. The speakers at this event demonstrated how postgraduates can approach the move from a research degree to career paths outside of the academic sector not as a barrier but as an opportunity. Finally, we would like to thank Len Scales for his History Department news and notes. His contributions, not only in this edition but also for the past several years during which he has served as head of the department, have always elevated the publication.

 Redactions, combinations, and gaps within archival collections can confound historical research but, equally, they challenge historians to critically examine received inscontribution, Hasaam Latif gacounts and periodisations. In his contribution, Hasaam Latif uses uncertainties in newspaper accounts and their unreliable naming conventions to describe both the difficulty and importance
 nationalist cultural order amidst territorial instability. Geographic imaginaries, like historical mythmaking, have arisen as cortuinations. In his contribution, Hasaam Latif arcounts and their unreliable naming conventions to describe both the difficulty and importance
 nationalist cultural order amidst territorial instability. Geographic imaginaries, like historical mythmaking, have arisen as contribution, Hasaam Latif deftly argues in her article. She scrutinises the origins of perceived parallels between Britain and Japan in nineteenth-century maps and travelogues and finds that

SYMEON BOARD OF EDITORS:



MARIE BIGOTTE



ALASTAIR FORBES Editor



AVARNA OJHA Editor



ZOE SHIPLEY Editor

to critically examine received narratives and periodisations. In his contribution. Hasaam Latif uses uncertainties in newspaper accounts and their unreliable naming conventions to describe both the difficulty and importance of tracing South Asian lascars' presence in nineteenth-century Britain. His work prompts researchers to share with each other their perplexing moments in the archive, especially when searching for elusive voices. The boundaries imposed by traditional periodisation also present dilemmas for historians to contend with. George Goodfellow approaches this sort of boundary head-on in his essay, which outlines how contrasts between law codes and episcopal visitation records can aid historians in building a more nuanced understanding of the transition between the medieval and the early modern

Museums and cultural exhibitions are the sites of boundary-making in Maksymilian Loth-Hill's article on the western 'reclaimed lands' of post-World War II Poland. He demonstrates that the circumscription of history and heritage unevenly enforced a territorial instability. Geographic imaginaries, like historical mythmaking, have arisen as justifications for complex imperia ideologies, as Annabel Storr deftly argues in her article. She scrutinises the origins of perceive parallels between Britain and Japan in nineteenth-century map and travelogues and finds that these sources' assertion of island identities ultimately propped up notions of British exceptionalism. These two pieces use innovative archival strategies to understand the making and unmaking of borders as an unstable process and to denaturalise political presumptions which continue to hold influence today.

People are not powerless in the face of states' assertions of boundaries. Two intriguing case studies show us the power of contestation in the making of border policies and borderlands. Fergal Leonard explores the intricate roles played by English and Scottish women in the border families of the sixteenth century. He observes that while these women were excluded from formal politics and faced gendered restrictions on their behaviour. they nonetheless were agents in asserting border families' political claims and especially in the forging of cross-border alliances. Extending



Front cover: Image courtesy of Durham University. This page: Image courtesy of Durham University.



Contents

Department News	
These Cherished Isles: Imagining Japan in Early Nineteenth-Century British Geographical Texts 10	
Blackmail, gaolbreak, and football: the women of the 'riding surnames' in the Anglo-Scottish marches, c.1580—1603	
Anticlericalism and the Politicisation of Religion during the Medieval to Early Modern Transition	
What is a Lascar? A Cautionary Approach to Utilising Archives in the Research of Minority Communities	
'Reclaimed Lands': Cultural Heritage and the Transformation of Post-War Poland's Western Territories 26	
Deconstructing 'Marital Race' Theory and Demystifying Boundaries Through the Gurkha Justice Campaign 30	
Careers event for postgraduate and early career historians	
Contact us	

Image courtesy of Durham University.



Professor Len Scales Head of the Department of History



Department News

It's a worrying time to be a historian in a United Kingdom university. Every week brings more news of cutbacks, of programmes and entire departments closing, of voluntary redundancy schemes launching and, increasingly, of distinguished scholars and teachers being forced out against their wishes. Yet all this comes at a time when the public appetite for History is greater than ever before: you could, if you wished and had the time, listen to History podcasts all day every day and never run out of new material. The History section of your local bookshop is likely to be among its biggest – although many of the books there will not be the work of professional historians. And we have never needed historians more.

We live in a time in which a Russian president seeks to justify his war of aggression by lecturing an American media pundit for half an hour on medieval Russian history. Tyrants and despots are usually keen on History, so long as it can be twisted to legitimize their ambitions and glorify their own actions. And History today is everywhere. The ongoing tragedy in the Middle East is rooted in rival, seemingly irreconcilable, accounts of both the remote and the much more recent, past of the lands that some people call Israel and others call Palestine. Rising global powers rest their claims and future ambitions on nationalistic interpretations of their own past, while politicians offer 'alternative' versions of truth and historical memory. There is more need than ever for critical, independent-minded citizens with wide historical horizons and with skills in closely analysing evidence, dissecting historical narratives, and reaching their own informed conclusions. An education in History is, in part, an education in detecting fakes: fake documents, fake images, fake news, fake claims, fake statesmen. It has never been more necessary.



It is therefore a great relief to be able to report that History at Durham is in excellent health, and that the Department remains as committed as ever to providing the broad, varied, exciting, and challenging historical education on which we pride ourselves. We can offer the diversity and strength in depth that come from being a big department, and we are fortunate in being able still to recruit the outstanding undergraduate and postgraduate students who are our lifeblood. And we continue to be joined by new teachers and researchers. During the past year Drs Maks Loth-Hill, Rob Bates, and David Schley took up posts in the Department as teaching fellows in, respectively, twentieth-century European history and nineteenth- and twentieth-century American history. New researchers also joined us: Dr Benedetta Carnaghi, a British Academy Newton Fellow working on anti-fascist humour in Italy, France, and Germany, 1932-1945, and Dr Nick McGee, a Leverhulme Early Career Fellow researching Chinese indentured labour in modern southern

Africa. (Nick is already a familiar face around the Department, which he first joined in 2021 as a fixed-term lecturer in modern Chinese history.) At the same time, we are broadening our horizons still further. We are currently in the process of recruiting two permanent Assistant Professors, in European History 300-1050 CE with Digital Humanities and in Modern American History with Environmental Humanities. These will allow us to build more interdisciplinary connections in our teaching and research, as well as reinforcing old-established areas of departmental strength.

New and forthcoming books by members of the Department underline the breadth and richness of our research. Radha Kapuria's *Music in Colonial Punjab: Courtesans, Bards, and Connoisseurs 1800-1947* was published last year by Oxford University Press and was followed early this year by Tom Hamilton's *A Widow's Vengeance after the Wars of Religion,* also published by Oxford. Due to appear later in the year is Chris Bahl's Mobile Manuscripts: Learning across the Early Modern Western Indian Ocean (Cambridge University Press). Research grants won by members of the Department during the past year highlight the ways in which the histories that we study - including those of remote periods - intersect with and illuminate contemporary concerns. Alex Brown has been awarded a large Leverhulme Trust Project Grant as principal investigator for a project on 'Modelling the Black Death and Social Connectivity in Medieval England'. Alex will work with colleagues in the Archaeology and Physics departments, applying the latest computer modelling developed in response to the COVID-19 outbreak to simulate the spread of the Black Death in England in 1348-49. Rebecca Clifford secured a Leverhulme Research Fellowship to work on her next book, provisionally called The Lingfield Children, looking at a small group of child concentration camp survivors studied by Anna Freud in the early postwar period. History's own Giles Gasper, as Deputy Executive Dean for Research, secured £2.6 million of Durham University funding for 'Heritage 360', a project to nurture new research at the intersection of cultural and natural heritage. The award will bring new academic posts to several Durham departments, including History.

As a department committed to research-led teaching, we introduce our students from the start to the same chronological, geographical, and thematic breadth that is reflected in our own research. This year Chris Bahl, Radha Kapuria, and Jonathan Saha won a Durham 'Global Curriculum Award' for their innovative new Level 1 module 'South Asia: Texts, Artefacts, Empires', which makes use of objects and manuscripts from the Oriental Museum and the Library's Special Collections. The award also acknowledges staff in the Oriental Museum and University Library who support the teaching of the module. The infrastructure for delivering our teaching, meanwhile, was strengthened and expanded in September 2023, when the Department made a long-awaited move into new,

purpose-made accommodation, including two new seminar rooms, at 58 Saddler Street. This now joins our old-established bases on the Peninsula, 43-6 North Bailey and Cosin's Hall on Palace Green, and represents a significant improvement in our facilities for students and their teachers.

So. Durham remains Durham. But the History Department does not exist in isolation from the north-east of England, where we live and work - a region whose rich and ancient past provides us with so much inspiration. We recognize how much we owe to the Northeast, and we are more committed than ever to making our History programme as accessible as possible to all students who can benefit from it. and especially to students from our region. We have therefore been hugely fortunate to be able from this year, through the generosity of a donor, to offer three undergraduate scholarships to students from state schools and low-income families in the region to study History at Durham. These Dr John Wreglesworth Scholarships also allow their recipients, if they meet our criteria, to go on to take an MA in the Department. They are not, however, the only step which we have taken to widen student access to our programme. Thanks, above all, to the tireless hard work of Alex Barber, the Department launched this year a Bridging Programme, aimed at giving incoming first-year students from areas of traditionally low participation in higher education a head-start in their university careers. Our Bridging Programme students spent a week in September 2023, before the start of Michaelmas Term, gaining an early taste of both departmental and college life. The week was by general agreement a huge success, and the Bridging Programme will be repeated on a more ambitious scale at the start of the coming academic year. The Department is grateful for the support which we received from across the university, but thanks are due especially to Hatfield College for hosting our Bridging Programme students and to the Durham Centre for Academic

Development for supporting the week's events in the Department.

Several members of the Department were recognized in the past year with promotions. Anne Heffernan and Amanda Herbert became Associate Professors and Natalie Mears and Jonathan Saha were promoted to full Professors: congratulations to one and all. The year also, however, brought the sad news of the death of a long-serving and very popular departmental teacher and colleague, Dr Jim Callanan, on 22 September 2023. Jim's colleagues in American history are currently organizing a research event in the Department in his memory. This is my final *Symeon* news roundup before I step down as Head

of Department in the summer. The last three years have been quite a ride, but it has been a great honour to lead for a while such a wonderful community of historians, from firstyear undergraduates through to distinguished academic colleagues. I wish my successor, Professor Julie-Marie Strange, all the very best. And of course, do stay in touch with us: your teachers in the Department are always delighted to hear from you. And if you find yourself back in Durham, drop in and say hello.

Music in Colonial Punjab

Courtesans, Bards, and Connoisseurs, 1800–1947



Radha Kapuria

Radha Kapuria, *Music in Colonial Punjab: Courtesans, Bards, and Connoisseurs* 1800-1947, (Oxford University Press, 2023).



Figure 1: Image courtesy of Queen Mary University of London Archives and Special Collections, Rare Books collection, ref. D18 GUT.



Annabel Storr

Annabel is a third year PhD candidate in Chinese History Studies at Durham University funded by an AHRC Northern Bridge studentship. She previously received an MA from Durham University in History, as well as a BA (Hons) in History & Politics from the University of Warwick. Her research utilises themes of identity and self-reflection to explore the complex evolution of British conceptions of China and Japan during the nineteenth century and the impact of this on British self-identity. She is particularly interested in the incorporation of digital humanities methods into historical research.

Twitter @annabel_storr

These Cherished Isles:

Imagining Japan in Early Nineteenth-Century British Geographical Texts

Japan in the early-nineteenth-century British imagination acted as a place both known yet unknowable, at once both different from Britain and the same. Sharing geographical features as islands off a continental mainland and compounded by an absence of experience in a period in which interactions between Britain and Japan were highly restricted. Japan captured the imagination of both British writers and their readership. Geographical and compilation texts served as key sources of information about Japan in an absence of firsthand accounts by British travellers, who were not formally permitted to travel to Japan until the late 1850s following the signing of the 1858 Anglo-Japanese Treaty of Amity and Commerce. They both shaped and reflected existing ideas of Japan, drawing heavily upon the small number of non-British travel accounts published across the centuries. Frequently republishing passages from their predecessors with little to no alterations, these texts constructed a body in which ideas extracted from a small number of sources were repeatedly recycled, constructing coherence from a handful of scattered accounts.

In early-nineteenth-century British writings about Japan, geography and climate became closely entwined with imagination to form powerful geographic imaginaries that shaped ideas of both Japan and Britain. Writing at the turn of the nineteenth century. John Pinkerton in his influential. and widely cited, Modern Geography argued that 'The Japanese islands may in some measure be compared with Great Britain and Ireland, forming a grand insular power near the eastern extremity of Asia, like that of the British isles near the western extremity of Europe." These geographic imaginaries shaped and distorted Japan's physical geography to fit into this idea of twin isles of East and West, reshaping not only Japan's geographical realities but also those of Britain. Writing shortly after Pinkerton, John Smith in his 1811 A System of Modern Geography argued that: 'Were South and North Britain divided by an arm of the sea, Japan might be aptly compared to England, Scotland, and Ireland, with their respective smaller islands, peninsulas, bays, channels, &c., all under the same monarch.'2 Here, the similarities, or rather potential for similarity, were emphasised to the exclusion of the realities of the differences between the two island nations. Britain's own geography was reimagined to fit these geographic imaginaries.

John Pinkerton, Modern Geography, a Description of the Empires, Kingdoms, States, and Colonies, with the Oceans, Seas, and Isles, in All Parts of the World: Including the Most Recent Discoveries, and Political Alterations (London, 1806), p. 360. John Smith, A System of Modern Geography, Volume II (London, 1811), p. 909.

2.

Writing at the advent of firsthand British travel to Japan at the turn of the 1860s, S.B. Kemish mirrored earlier geographical writers from the beginning of the century. In his 1860 Japanese Empire Kemish asserted that 'It has been called "the Great Britain of the East," for Japan is to Asia what Great Britain is to Europe. It has about the same area, population, climate, insular position between a great continent and a great ocean; and a maritime metropolis with the same population.'³ These ideas of a shared Anglo-Japanese island identity were not limited to non-fiction texts. Similar ideas can be found expressed in fictionalised works such as H. Morley's 'Phantom Voyage' to Japan published in 1851 in Household Words, a weekly journal edited by Charles Dickens, published between March 1850 and May 1859.⁴ Describing Japan, Morley stated that 'The main island. Nippon, is larger than Ireland, and is important enough to have been justly called the England of the Pacific Ocean.'⁵ Adopting the same format as compilation texts published at the time, the article narrated a fictional voyage, referencing the experiences of earlier travellers such as the Russian Naval officer Vasily Golovnin.

These geographic imaginaries not only reshaped geography but also influenced ideas around the relative cultures and historical development of the two island nations. Ideas of islands were not neutral but instead embodied with meanings and interpretations from consequences of climate to their influence on the historical development of societies. Comparisons between Britain and Japan went beyond surface level analogies of the physical shape and size of the two island nations to encompass geopolitical dimensions, particularly both island nations being 'grand insular powers' in close proximity to a continental mainland.⁶ During the early nineteenth century, in a period of uncertainty and insecurity in the face of the Napoleonic Wars (1803-15), many British writers consciously reflected on their own island nature. These frequently took the form of economic considerations, such as the writings of William Spence

who published *Britain Independent of Commerce* in 1807.⁷ Underpinned by emerging theories of environmental determinism, these reflections on the nature of islands, however, went beyond just commerce and trade to encompass morals, virtues, and historical development. Crucial to these ideas was the argument that Britain had achieved its present-day success by virtue of the inherent features of its island nature. Two key features identified were Britain's climate and its close proximity to, yet being still physically separated from, a continental mainland.

In imagining a shared island identity underpinned by geographical and cartographical similarities, British writers in the early nineteenth century placed Japan into these British narratives of exceptionalism. Descriptions of Japan frequently referred to the distinction of its climate and historical development from its continental Asian neighbours. The apparent similarities between the two island nations constructed a need for Japan to have, or at least have the potential to develop, a culture and civilisation equally as exceptional as Britain's own. The absence of such features in the face of apparent close similarities between the two island nations would have presented a challenge to those who argued that Britain owed its exceptionalism, and therefore success, to its specific island nature. Writing at a period in which relations between Britain and Japan were on the precipice of transition. Kemish concluded his aforementioned Japanese Empire with the assertion that 'We may without fear predict that, after the ordeal of the first period of intercourse with Western nations, the people of Japan will advance rapidly in the scale of nations, and probably, favoured by their insular position and peculiar characteristics, become the leaders of Eastern civilization.'8



Figure 2: Archives and Special Collections, Bangor University, Bangor G115.S63 1810.



Figure 3: Archives and Special Collections, Bangor University, Bangor G115.S63 1810.

Geographical imaginaries continued to exert a major influence throughout the nineteenth century, with the idea of Japan continuing to reshape geographical realities even in the face of greater knowledge of Japan. Writing a few years after Kemish, one of the earliest British travellers to Japan and the consul for the newly opened British consulates at the treaty ports of first Nagasaki and later Hakodate, Christopher Pemberton Hodgson, opened his account of Japan with a reflection on its similarities to Britain. Mirroring his earlier nineteenth century counterparts, he remarked that 'The Atlantic and North Seas wash the one, the Pacific and Japan Seas bound the other. The latitudes of Great Britain are higher, but vet occupy nearly the same amount of degrees." In spite of their firsthand experiences of the country, British writers continued to reshape and reimagine Japan's geography to fit their own preexisting ideas of Japan's similarities with Britain.

Despite the transformations both Britain and Japan have undergone since the nineteenth century, the idea of a shared island identity continues to resonate in present day ideas of Japan. Published in 2015, an article in the Sunday Times on the V&A's Japanese gallery, declared that 'Japan and Britain are very similar. Events in the Second World War may have clouded these similarities, but if you look at a globe, you will see they are essentially mirror images of each other. Both are island nations cast adrift at the ends of continents - Britain to the west of Europe, Japan to the east of Asia.¹⁰ The legacy of these geographical imaginaries continues to shape the ways in which people, especially in Britain, think about and imagine Japan. Islands, and the connections between them, continue to exert a powerful influence over how we think about the world and our place in it today.

- S.B. Kemish, The Japanese Empire: Its Physical, Political, and Social Condition an d History: With Details of the Late American and British Expeditions (London, 1860), p. 61.
- H. Morley, 'Our Phantom Ship: Japan', Household Words, 3 (1851), pp. 160-7.
- H. Morley, 'Our Phantom Ship', p. 160.

5

6

- Pinkerton, *Modern Geography*, p. 360.
- of Commerce: Or, Proofs, Deduced from an Investigation Into the True Causes of the Wealth of Nations, that Our Riches, Prosperity, and Power, are Derived from Sources Inherent in Ourselves, and Would Not be Affected, Even Though Our Commerce Were Annihilated (London, 1807).

William Spence, Britain Independent

 Kemish, The Japanese Empire, p. 303.

7

 Christopher Pemberton Hodgson, *A Residence at Nagasaki and Hakodate in 1859–1860: With an Account of Japan Generally* (London, 1861), p. xi.

10. Waldernar Januszczak, 'lt's Just Child's Play for Them', *Sunday Times* (8 November 2015), issue 9974, p. 13.



Figure 1: Bewcastle from the air. Photo courtesy of Jonathan Fraser, 'Cumbria and the Borders History.'

Blackmail, gaolbreak, and football: the women of the 'riding surnames' in the Anglo-Scottish marches, c.1580–1603¹

In memory of Professor Maureen Meikle

Women rarely feature prominently in either popular or academic works on the early modern Anglo-Scottish borders. Historians often focus on the depredations of the 'riding surnames', or 'border reivers'—the turbulent, clannish families of the frontier infamous for their crossborder cattle-rustling and feud-violence. Where women do appear, it is most often as victims: their money extorted as 'blackmail', their homes ransacked, and their livestock reived away. But, as the late Maureen Meikle demonstrates in her article 'Victims, Viragos and Vamps: Women of the Sixteenth-century Anglo-Scottish Frontier', the women of the borders were not merely passive victims, but played prominent, active roles in their borderland communities.² My own research on the English west march (modern-day Cumbria) has relied on highly gendered sources: treatises and correspondence concerning the governance of the frontier, written by men and implicitly excluding women from their attention; reports of raids, violence, and crime (almost!) invariably committed by men; and petitions and appeals to Queen Elizabeth's government which were usually made by and on behalf of men. The political culture of the marches marginalised women through its masculine rhetoric of the 'queen's service'—the duty of subjects to participate in the defence of the frontier in peace and war. In my sources, then, women are largely voiceless and very often nameless, when they appear at all. But even here, there is evidence which sheds light on the lives of these often-overlooked individuals.



Dr Fergal Leonard

Dr Fergal Leonard is an honorary fellow of the Durham University history department. His PhD project 'Society, governance, and politics in the Elizabethan west march, c.1570 – 1603' explored the political culture of north-west England in the reign of Elizabeth I, with a particular focus on how local people participated in government and the relationship between the 'riding surnames' and the early modern state. His research was funded through the generosity of the Wolfson Foundation. He can be contacted at fergal.leonard@durham.ac.uk.

The broadest and most superficial evidence of their lives comes from complaints of marriages between English and Scottish men and women. These were usually illegal but were nevertheless common. In 1583 Thomas Musgrave, captain of Bewcastle, produced a report on 'the Ryders, and ill doers' of the western borders, in which he detailed dozens of such 'alliances' between the English and' Scottish families who dwelt along the rivers Esk, Liddel, and Kershop which divided the two kingdoms. Their chief men usually had Scottish mothers and wives, and in turn their sisters and daughters were married to Scots.²

The women concerned went unnamed in Musgrave's report, referred to only by their relationship to the head men of their families. Their existence, however, was clearly both important and deeply problematic to English officers. They linked English and Scottish families together and, as such, facilitated cross-border raiding. Musgrave complained that English families 'bringe in scotsmen to do execucons of theire pretence, and make them selves clere of those crymes, that theire brothers sonnes sisters children, and other nere kynfolke & allyance doe.⁴⁴ And families not intermarried with the Scots were left vulnerable: the Routledge family had 'but little' marriages with their neighbours, Musgrave reported grimly, and 'for that they are every mans praye.⁵

Musgrave does give some small indication of what the lives of these women were like in one respect at least. Thomas Carleton, land-sergeant of Gilsland, was married to a daughter of Gorth (George) Graham of Kirkandrews and, through her, related to many of the most infamous English and Scottish raiders. Musgrave complained, 'his wyfes frend[es] will come on the daie to him & her and spoyle on the night as they go home'—i.e. that thieves used the opportunity of social calls on Carleton's wife to steal from Englishmen on their return journey.^c This allegation reinforces how problematic marriages amongst the 'surnames' were. But it also evidences the ease with which English men and women crossed the border to visit friends and family in the other realm, and as such the place of these women in their thriving cross-border community.

Such socialising was only recorded when it gave rise to these kinds of complaints, a fact with which Musgrave was personally familiar. His second wife was a Scotswoman named Susanna, and his illegitimate daughter (possibly by Susanna, although she was born before Musgrave's first wife died in 1591) was married to the Scotsman Sim Armstrong, Laird of Whithaugh, one of the most infamous members of that infamous family. Sim and his wife frequently visited Musgrave at Bewcastle, and in May 1599 came with their Scottish friends for 'football playing and after bat [that] a drvnkvng'.⁷ Like other journeys before this, it would have left no trace in the archives at all if Sim's Northumbrian enemies had not learned of his presence and come to capture him. The Scottish Armstrongs and Englishmen of Bewcastle cooperated to fight off the Northumbrians, killing two and taking twentysix prisoners; and Sim escaped back to Scotland, while his English wife stayed with her father in Bewcastle.⁶

While women appear infrequently in sources on marcher society, they are even less visible in sources on marcher governance. The formal political avenues which linked the northern marches to Elizabeth's court were invariably restricted for women. They were controlled by the martial office of Lord Warden, who usually rewarded active marcher service—standing watch on the frontier, resisting or pursuing raiders, and participating in incursions into Scotland—and so favoured the male elite who could most conspicuously perform such service. As such, when women of the 'surnames' required the intervention of Elizabeth's government, more informal avenues were

- I am grateful to the Wolfson Foundation, whose funding has made my research possible, and to Professor Natalie Mears for her feedback on this article.
- Maureen Meikle, 'Victims, Viragos and Vamps: Women of the Sixteenth-century Anglo-

Scottish Frontier' in John C. Appleby and Paul Dalton eds., *Government, Religion and Society in Northern England 1000-1700* (Sutton Publishing, Stroud, 1997), pp.172–184. Women as the victims of crime is outside of the scope of this article; for valuable discussion of the subject, see Meikle, 'Victims,

Viragos and Vamps', pp.173–175, and Jackson Armstrong, England's Northern Frontier: Conflict and Local Society in the Fifteenth-Century Scottish Marches (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2020), pp.160–162. SP59/22 ff.142—151 (Musgrave's report, late 1583).

- lbid., f.150r.
- 5. Ibid., f.145r

4

6. Ibid., f.148v.

- SP59/38 ff.78r. (report on Bewcastle fray, 13 May 1599).
 - Ibid., ff. 80—81 (Woodrington to Carey, 18 May 1599), 120r. (allegations acgainst Musgrave, June 1599); Joseph Nicolson and Richard Burn, *The History and Antiquities of*

the Counties of Westmoriand and Cumberland (London, 1777), vol.2, p.595; John Gough Nichols ed., The Topographer and Genealogist (Nichols and Son, London, 1858), vol.3, p.417. appealing. In 1583, for example, the Scotswoman Margaret Johnstone was widowed when her English husband, Andrew Graham of the Mote, was killed in a skirmish by Thomas Musgrave. She and her brother-in-law Richard travelled to Barns-elms, the country home of Queen Elizabeth's principal secretary Sir Francis Walsingham. There she appealed for Walsingham's personal favour in achieving justice and ultimately won a considerable annual pension for her eldest son as compensation for her husband's life.⁹

Preexisting ties of friendship and alliance could help women enlist the support of alternative sources of influence. The Scotswoman Lucrece Fleming sought help in her native country when, in 1600, she was forcibly dispossessed of the home of her deceased husband, Rob Graham of the Fauld, by his sons from a former marriage. She was the illegitimate daughter of John, Lord Fleming, and her own first husband, John Stewart of Rosland, had been a valet to James VI. She evidently maintained contacts at the Scottish court and so she travelled to Holyrood for an audience with the king, who wrote an effusive letter to the English Lord Warden, Thomas Scrope, asking him to see her restored.¹⁰

Women could also be involved in the criminal activity for which the borders were so infamous. In 1597, the gentlemen of the west march complained that Blanche Baites, the Scottish wife of Richard Graham of Brackenhill, collected blackmail (protection money) from the tenants of Gilsland. Brackenhill's friends amongst the Armstrongs of Liddesdale raided those who refused to pay.¹¹ And after the Scotsman William Armstrong of Kinmont was illegally arrested and imprisoned in Carlisle in 1596, his wife played a key role in his celebrated rescue by the Scottish officer Walter Scott of Buccleuch. Her name has been lost, but she was the English daughter of Hutcheon (Hugh) Graham of Guards. Shortly before the rescue she visited her husband in the outer



Figure 2: Carlisle Castle. Photo courtesy of Neil Boothman.

 SP59/22 f.33r. (Brackenhill to Walsingham, 7 April 1583); SP59/31 f.170r. (Graham family tree, summer 1596). SP59/39 f.33r. (James to Scrope, 25 June 1600); 'Stirling register,' The Scottish Antiquary 7, no. 25 (1892), p.38; Amy L. Juhala, 'The Household and Court of King James VI of Scotland, 1567-1603', (PhD diss., University of Edinburgh, 2000), p.314. SP59/31 f.181v. (Robson's testimony, 11 June 1596); SP59/34 ff.142–143 (west march jury, 30 April 1597). 12. SP59/31 ff.127v. (Scrope to Leigh, 14 April 1596).

Figure 3: Gilnockie Tower, 1837. Photo courtesy of M.L. Woolfolk.

ward of Carlisle Castle, where he had

been lodged, to gather intelligence

and 'make it all w[ith] kinmont'-i.e.

that he could prepare himself.¹² This

may have been the same visit where

Kinmont was given Buccleuch's ring,

him'.¹³ The intelligence which she and

free Kinmont, and escape before any

'for a token for his deliuerance by

other Grahams provided allowed

Buccleuch to break into the castle,

effective resistance could be made

on the rainy night of 13 April 1596,

an exploit which sent shockwaves through the borderlands, caused

to appraise him of the attempt so

13. Ibid., f.136r. (Graham to Scrope, 24 April 1596).

tremors at the courts of both Queen Elizabeth of England and King James of Scotland, and passed into border folklore.

These fragmentary references only give the slightest glimpses of the women of the 'riding surnames'; and they are glimpses which are filtered through the perspective of the men who wrote these manuscripts. They are, nevertheless, glimpses which give us an insight into the lives of people who might otherwise have remained hidden. They demonstrate the vital role these women played in their communities, and the importance which march officers placed on their existence and their influence, even if they stubbornly refused to name them in their reports. And they show us a little of the character of the women who lived their lives in a turbulent, often dangerous place and time, on the perilous fringes of two kingdoms.



. FOCKIE - OR JOHNNY ARMETRONG'E TOWER (Duadries shire.) 1. 194-

17

Anticlericalism and the **Politicisation of Religion**

during the Medieval to Early Modern Transition



George Goodfellow

George Goodfellow is a second-year undergraduate in the History department. After initially exploring the English Reformation in Sixth Form, George has enjoyed uncovering and debating the deeper aspects of its historiography, such as anticlericalism. George hopes to continue analysing the importance of religion during the Medieval to Early Modern transition, and whether similar trends are present in other European countries during their Reformations in his dissertation.

Over time, history has faced increasing periodisation. Yet these periods themselves have become subjects of intense debate, even as to their names.¹ It seems futile, not to mention ahistorical, to attempt to prescribe precise dates to periods such as the 'Middle Ages' or the 'Early Modern' given the immense variation by geography and field: Italian Art crossed the boundary well before English Religion.² Rather, there was a process of transition in which the boundaries between periods were gradually crossed. The Reformation highlights the significance of religion to the English transition between these periods. This transition was not one towards the secularism of modernity but the politicisation of religion.³ The physical relationship between the Church and State was fundamentally changed by the Reformation: so too was the ideological utility of religion. The use

the legislation which justified the Henrician Reformation is a case study which perhaps best illustrates this transition towards the politicisation of religion.⁴ The Acts which achieved the break with Rome, and Henry VIII's divorce to enable his marriage to Anne Boleyn, painted a picture which sharply contrasted with the realities of the visitation records (documents recording the visit, and examination, of a parish church by an archbishop or his subordinates), hence unveiling their true political motivation. The appropriation of religious vocabulary for political propaganda was an evolution from the Church's complete control over religious aspects of propaganda during the Medieval period. This new significance of religion within politics was further illustrated by the *Realpolitik* approach of Elizabeth I. Therefore, the legislation which

of anticlericalism as propaganda in

subsumed the Church into the State simultaneously morphed religion into a state-controlled political weapon: the Church lost its autonomy as religion lost its innocence.

The Acts of the Henrician Reformation presented a thoroughly one-sided, negative view of the clergy.⁵ For example, the 1532 Supplication against the Ordinaries lamented the greed of the clergy who charged extortionate fees in their courts for work which took far too long.⁶ While historians debate the true motivations behind the Supplication, whether it be the self-interest of lay lawyers or a Cromwellian political manoeuvre, they agree that the presented anticlericalism was a façade.7 It was a similar story in the 1534 Act of Supremacy. Henry VIII's elevation to Supreme Head of the Church was justified by a need

- 1 Heather Dubrow and Frances E. Dolan, 'The Term Early Modern,' PMLA 109, no. 5 (1994), p. 1025.
- 2 Mitchell Greenberg, 'The Concept of 'Early Modern," Journal for Early Modern Cultural Studies 13, no. 2 (2013), p. 75.
- P.G.J.M. Raedts, 'When Were The 3 Middle Ages?' Nederlands Archief Voor Kerkgeschiedenis / Dutch Review of Church History 76, no. 1 (1996), p. 9.
- Patrick Collinson, 'The Politics of Religion and the Religion of Politics in Elizabethan England,' Historical Research 82, no. 215 (2009), p. 75.

4

5.

- Nelson H. Minnich, Review of Anticlericalism in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe, by Peter A. Dykema, Heiko A. Oberman, The Catholic Historical Review 83. no. 3 (1997), p. 453.
- Gerald Bray (ed.), Documents of the 6 English Reformation, 3rd edition, (Cambridge, 2019), pp. 39, 41;

Margaret Bowker, 'The Commons Supplication against the Ordinaries in the Light of Some Archidiaconal Acta: The Alexander Prize Essay,' Transactions of the Royal Historical Society, 21 (1971), pp. 66, 70.

Christopher Haigh, English Reformations: Religion, Politics, and Society Under the Tudors (Oxford, 1993), p. 111: Bowker, 'The Commons Supplication against the Ordinaries, pp. 75-6.

to 'extirp all errors, heresies' and 'to visit, repress, redress, reform, order, correct, restrain, and amend all such errors, heresies, abuses, offences, contempts, and enormities, whatsoever they be.'8 This intense repetition through synonyms emphasises the need for reform, implicitly denouncing the clergy for their failings. However, when we analyse the visitation records to evaluate public opinion on the clergy, we find no basis for such an anticlerical picture. The complaints within the Kentish visitations focus more on the failings of individual clergy: not singing mass frequently enough, abuses of the tithes, or absenteeism.9 Moreover, the very fact that such matters constituted these complaints suggests they were abnormal and contravened the acceptable morality of society. This is supported by the infrequent nature of clerical abuses in the Lincoln diocese: out of over 1000 parishes, there were 25 accusations of sexual misconduct, 17 of irregular services and 5 that the priest was too infirm for his job.¹⁰ There was little concern over such complaints within the Church courts. directly contradicting the claims of Parliament. Instead, the Church courts were regarded as a cheap and efficient alternative route to justice.¹¹ Furthermore, as Margaret Bowker has illustrated, there was no change in the efficiency of the Church courts in resolving cases.¹² In fact, there was more concern with those who refused to conform: the people of Kennington complained that 'Thomas Ambrose was not confessed and did not communicate in his parish church at Easter last.'13 Therefore, the masses were more (pro-)clerical than

- Bray, Documents of the English 8 Reformation, p. 98.
- R. N. Swanson, Catholic England 9 (Manchester University Press, 2013), pp 262-3.
- Haigh, English Reformations, p. 42. 10
- 11. Ibid., p. 49
- 12 Bowker, 'The Commons Supplication against the Ordinaries,' p. 67.
- 13. Swanson, Catholic England, p. 266.



Figure 1: Henry VIII (Hans Holbein the Younger) and Anne Boleyn (Hever Rose Portrait), the woman Henry broke from Rome to marry.

anything else: they still supported their Church.¹⁴ The accusations of Parliament, then, were exaggerated at the very least, if not fabricated.¹⁵ The shaky foundations of these anticlerical accusations reveal the raw political machinations behind them.

Why did the government employ this anticlerical propaganda to justify their actions? This requirement for justification can be understood through Ethan Shagan's 'Collaboration' thesis.¹⁶ Shagan argued for the necessity of collaboration between the government and the governed to achieve the Reformation.¹⁷ Anticlericalism was the 'point of contact' used to explain Parliament's actions to the people, hence maintaining their support.¹⁸ Anticlericalism, then, was the religious vocabulary used to justify a political reformation. It reflected how the Reformation fundamentally altered the relationship between religion and the state, as religion acquired a newfound political importance. This governmental use of religion indicated its politicisation as it rose to the 'preeminent place' it occupied in politics after the Reformation.¹⁹ The Church was both subsumed physically by the state and ideologically as its religious foundations were appropriated for political endeavours.

It is perhaps useful to step back to appreciate this change more fully. Religion and politics have been intertwined since the inception of the English state, a legacy harking back to the law codes of King Æthelberht of Kent in the seventh century.²⁰ However, the Henrician reformation was a key juncture in this relationship. In the medieval period, especially during the Hundred Years War, the clergy were used to spread propaganda through their prayers to secure and maintain support for the king and his government.²¹ In a sense, the government was outsourcing the religious aspect of their propaganda to the Church; they lacked the spiritual authority and credibility to create it themselves. With the Henrician Reformation, the political subordination of the Church to the State signalled a change in how propaganda operated. The Church and State were no longer two separate entities, but one under the King's control.²² Henry VIII could now curtail the legislative freedom of the clergy by restricting the benefit of the clergy.²³ Furthermore, he exerted ideological control, as shown by the 'decanonisation' of Thomas Becket, the martyred Archbishop of Canterbury murdered by knights after the infamously ambiguous order of Henry II, in 1538.24 Therefore, the government acquired control of propaganda couched in religious language: no longer were they required to leave it to the Church alone. The aforementioned legislation of the Reformation clearly illustrates this.

The use of religion as a political tool for justification continued after the Reformation. Shagan highlights how the monarchy used 'religion to generate novel ... claims to state power.'25 This is not to suggest that the Church as an entity was no longer being used to channel propaganda, the propaganda of the pulpit, through prayers and sermons, remained.²⁶ However, it was the religious ideology of the Church which evolved into a political weapon. This politicisation of religion is apparent when we compare the religious attitudes of two monarchs on either side of our boundary. Henry VI was renowned for his piety and devotion, to such an extent that many people regarded him as a saint.²⁷ Elizabeth I, in contrast, was 'a politique rather than a *dévot*.²⁸ She pursued a religious settlement that was politically acceptable to her influential classes, rather than one according to her own beliefs. Even when more secure in power later in her reign, she refrained from altering it. Elizabeth wished not to 'make windows into men's souls,' preferring the political stability created by outward conformity to the instability of rigorous spiritual examination.²⁹ Therefore, for the monarch, religion became another political consideration instead of a deep-seated conviction. As the Church became part of the state, religion became part of politics.



Figure 2: Elizabeth I (George Gower, 1588, Armada Portrait) and Henry VI (Unknown artist, c. 1540). Henry's simpler dress, highlighting the cross on his chest, illustrates their differences in approaches to piety.

Perhaps paradoxically, religion's subjugation into politics saw it acquire immense political importance. Although the Church may have been somewhat weakened by the Reformation, its ideas ascended. The use of anticlerical propaganda in the Acts which achieved the Henrician Reformation brought to the forefront the power of religion in a different dimension than previously seen. It was the means with which to secure the collaboration of the people, by justifying their actions, without which the Reformation was impossible.³⁰ The Church no longer enjoyed complete control over the dissemination of religious propaganda. The means with which their political subordination was achieved simultaneously ensured their ideological subordination

as the government appropriated religion to explain their actions. Elizabeth I's *politique* religious approach, compared to Henry VI's devoutness. further emphasises this phenomenon of politicisation. While these monarchs perhaps occupy the extremes, they illustrate that religion, as well as the Church, was no longer a distinct entity to be treated separately: it was part of both state and politics. Nevertheless, it is important not to downgrade religion's significance. This was not one step in the inevitable path towards secularity and modernity. Religion maintained its importance, but the flavour, nature and attitudes towards it changed. To return to the periodisation which began this article, it seems that this religious paradigm is a useful lens

through which to analyse the status of transition in other countries. Did they transition towards the political religiosity of the Early Modern at a similar time as England? If not. why? Could this indicate the greater importance of other fields in these countries? The politicisation of religion in England in the 1530s suggests this to be the transitionary period across the boundary between the Medieval and Early Modern. Historians may lambast G.R. Elton's 'Tudor Revolution in Government', for cogent reasons, but it appears he, at the very least, had the correct imeframe for 'Revolution'.³¹

- Robert Swanson, 'Medieval Anticlericalism: Terms and Conditions' *History of religions* 61, no. 1 (2021), p. 14.
- A.G. Dickens, *The English Reformation*, Internet Archive (New York, 1964), p. 110; Bowker, 'The Commons Supplication against the Ordinaries,' p. 73.
- Ethan H. Shagan, Popular Politics and the English Reformation (Cambridge, 2003), p. 13.
- 17. Ibid., p. 307
- 18. Ibid., p. 133.

- Norman L. Jones, Review of works by Rosemary O'Day, Peter Iver Kaufman, G. W. Bernard, Jennifer Loach, and M. A. R. Graves, *Journal of British Studies* 28, no. 1 (1989), p. 72; Collinson, 'The Politics of Religion,' p. 75.
- Tom Lambert, 'Law before Æthelberht,' in Law and Order in Anglo-Saxon England (Oxford, 2017), p. 28.

19.

21.

W. R. Jones, 'The English Church and Royal Propaganda during the Hundred Years War,' *Journal of British Studies*, 19, no. 1 (1979), pp. 20, 23, 27. Collinson, 'The Politics of Religion,' p. 74.

22.

- C. B. Firth, 'Benefit of Clergy in the Time of Edward IV,' *The English Historical Review* 32, no. 126 (1917), p. 182.
- Victor Houliston, 'St Thomas Becket in the Propaganda of the English Counter-Reformation,' *Renaissance Studies*, 7, no. 1 (1993), p. 44.
- 25. Collinson, 'The Politics of Religion,' p. 78.
- 26. J. P. D. Cooper, Propaganda and the Tudor State: Political Culture in the Westcountry (Oxford, 2003), p. 11.

- 27. John M. Theilmann, 'The Miracles of King Henry VI of England,' *The Historian* 42, no. 3 (1980), p. 456-7.
- 28. Collinson, 'The Politics of Religion,' p. 80.
- Ethan H. Shagan, 'The English Inquisition: Constitutional Conflict and Ecclesiastical Law in the 1590s,' *The Historical Journal*, 47, no. 3 (2004): 541-65; John van Voorhis, *Review* of Elizabeth I and Her Parliaments: 1584-1601 by J. E. Neale, *The Yale Law Journal* 68, no. 8 (1959), p. 1732.
- 30. Shagan, Popular Politics and the English Reformation, p. 307.
- Christopher Coleman and David Starkey, Revolution Reassessed: Revisions in the History of Tudor Government and Administration, (Oxford, 1986); David Starkey, 'A Reply: Tudor Government: The Facts?' The Historical Journal, 31, no. 4 (1988): 921–31.

What is a Lascar?

A Cautionary Approach to Utilising Archives in the Research of Minority Communities



Hasaam Latif

Hasaam Latif is a third-year PhD student researching the transnational lives of Lascar sailors in Britain. He is also more broadly interested in the lives and histories of South Asians and Muslims in Britain. Recently he contributed a chapter, on Lascars in British Asylums, to a book called 'Scotland's Lascar Heritage,' published by Glasgow Museums, which received a nomination for Best Research Book at the Scottish National Book Awards 2023. Outside of his studies, Hasaam also works part-time as a Parliamentary Researcher for an All-Party Parliamentary Group.

THE HACKNEY MURDER.

After the disposal of the night charges at Worshipstreet police-court, yesterday, Frederick James, who is charged with the murder of Charles Stanley, by shooting him in a house in the Hackney-road, on Tuesday night, was placed in the dock before Mr. Hannay. The prisoner was defended by Mr. Douglas Straight, barrister.

Annie James was the first witness called. She said : I am a single woman. The man Stanley was a Lascar, living in the Kingsland-road. He was in the habit of bringing work to our place for master, but wanted to take it elsewhere, because they offered him 3d. a dozen more. He came yesterday as the men were sitting at tea. My brother was sitting in the frent room making out bills. The pistol used to be kept there for the purpose of his sleeping there to prevent robbers, several attempts having been made on the house.

Figure 1: Bristol Times and Mirror - Thursday 04 April 1872, p. 2. British Newspaper Archives.

Lascars were integral to the functioning of British merchant ships, serving as skilled sailors and labourers in an era defined by global commerce and colonial expansion.



Britain of nineteenth and twentieth centuries is often remembered through its bustling port cities, imperial exploits and naval supremacy. Yet an important presence is overlooked. Hailing primarily from the Indian subcontinent, Lascars were integral to the functioning of British merchant ships, serving as skilled sailors and labourers in an era defined by global commerce and colonial expansion. Yet these seafarers, as Conrad Dixon described, are the 'forgotten seaman' in the history of Britain.¹

This piece will walk through examples of cases where the idea of being a Lascar is misrepresented. unclear or stretched in archives and will encourage more thoughtful engagement about researching minority communities in archives. particularly in newspaper archives. Despite their significant presence, the process of tracing Lascars and minority communities within archival spaces is challenging. Caroline Bressey emphasises the idea of sharing our experiences, successes and apprehensions when conducting historical research in the coloured presence within archives.² Bressev states that, 'Uncovering evidence of their lives beyond the lines of an artist's pen, a witness record in an

Old Bailey session paper, a printed note in a newspaper, or a national census return has proven difficult. Research on the historical geographies of the black presence in Britain illustrates that it was usual for black men and women to have no reference made to the colour of their skin in institutional records.¹³ The same problems arise with Lascars in archival spaces. Lascars' memoirs and autobiographies were not preserved as they were seen as fringe members of the society. Dada Amir Haider Khan's *Chains to Lose* was a rare memoir.⁴ Largely, Lascars own narratives are absent in archival repositories and lost in the crowd.

The first incident that draws attention to the problems of newspaper reports was a death in Liverpool in 1862 where it was reported that an Irish fish-porter named James Rooney had a public-house dispute with a Lascar seaman on the Garibaldi question. It was stated the Lascar left the house, followed by Rooney and when in the street the Lascar shouted, "hurrah for Garibaldi." Following this it was reported that Rooney responded with "to hell with you and Garibaldi" before knocking him down. The Lascar fell, landing in front of a loaded lorry which rolled over him and killed him.⁵ One particularly interesting article stated that a Police-constable witnessed the event as he mentioned he saw a coloured man come out of Mrs Robinson's public house opposite, and put his hands up to his face, as though making grimaces at someone. Immediately afterwards Rooney came out of the house with a fish in his hand, with which he struck the coloured man, and then struck him with his fist. The Lascar then staggered back when Rooney struck him the second time and he fell under a lorry that was passing at the time, it was stated that he was taken to the Northern Hospital as quickly as possible but died about half an hour after admission. Henry Lawson,

who was the barman at the public house, stated that the Lascar was in the public house when Rooney entered while not quite sober. Soon after they had an argument about Garibaldi, the Lascar left the building followed by Rooney when the Lascar 'made faces' at him. It was then reported that Rooney, in his defence, said the Lascar struck him and pulled out a knife to him.⁶

How could an argument about Giuseppe Garibaldi lead to manslaughter in Liverpool? In 1862, Giuseppe Garibaldi had a long-standing feud with the Pope as he was seen as passionately anti-Catholic and anti-papal. This led to his expedition against Rome which birthed the famous nursery rhyme 'Garibaldi was wounded' after he had been shot in the foot and taken prisoner. In the wake of these events, there were major anti-Catholic riots in his name across Britain in 1862, with the Irish Catholics fighting in defence of their church. One specific case of a Garibaldi protest occurred in October, a few days before the death of the Lascar just described, where several working-class men met at Hyde Park to show sympathy with Garibaldi. However, there were also many supporters of the Pope that had appeared in his defence. This led to people shouting. "down with Garibaldi" and "Hurrah for the Pope" ultimately sparking a brawl.⁷ The tensions surrounding Garibaldi were thus present leading up to the death.

This case study indicates that the Lascar was aware of the political landscape of Britain while sharing 'a great feeling of admiration for the great Italian patriot' and furthermore that he knew that showing this admiration would provoke Rooney.⁸ However, this case also shows the necessity for a careful approach to reading these archival sources and the need to cross-reference to gain a full picture of events, as we rely on the newspaper reports for information which

7

- Caroline Bressey, "The City of Others: Photographs from the City of London Asylum Archive", 19: Interdisciplinary Studies in the Long Nineteenth Century 13, 2011. doi: https://doi. org/10.16995/ntn.625
- D.A.H Khan, Chains to Lose, Life and Struggles of a Revolutionary: Memoirs of Dada Amir Haider Khan, (University of Karachi, 2007).
- Miscellaneous, Hertfordshire Express and General Advertiser - Saturday 25 October 1862, page 4.

- Garibaldi and the Pope at Hyde-Park, Home News for India, China and the Colonies - Friday 03 October 1862, page 10.
- 8. Provincial, *Shields Daily Gazette*, Thursday 23 October 1862, page 2.

- Conrad Dixon, "Lascars: The Forgotten Seamen", in R. Ommer and G. Panting, (eds), The Working Men who Got Wet, St. Johns, (Newfoundland, 1980), pp. 263 – 281.
- Caroline Bressey, Archival interventions: Participatory Research and Public Historical Geographies, *Journal of Historical Geography*, Volume 46, 2014, Pages 102-104.

comes with challenges. James Frey has argued, 'newspaper accounts of lascar trials, however, must be used cautiously,' as 'sometimes, reporters even ignored the comments of seemingly unimportant witnesses, only to find, as a trial progressed, that these details later became important.'⁹ There is a consensus view throughout newspaper reports that the man in question was a Lascar, but the exceptional nature of the case means that researchers should thoroughly cross-reference and scrutinise reports to ensure that there are no discrepancies between accounts.

Variations or misspelling of names and false names also generate interpretive problems in Lascar history. In an article titled 'the Hackney Murder' a man named Frederick James, a bootmaker, was charged with the murder of Charles Stanley by shooting him in a house on Hackney Road.¹⁰ The newspaper described Stanley as a Lascar living in Kingsland Road, yet he had an anglicised name. Stanley may have been an example of a Lascar who changed his name to assimilate to British culture or, perhaps, an indication of a new definition of Lascar that was not limited to South Asia and Africa. This would not be the first time a researcher has come across a Lascar who did not have a recognizable South Asian, Muslim, or African name. Other articles, however, suggest that a mistake had been made; some newspapers claimed he was a Lascar while others stated he was a Laster, a workman whose business it is to shape boots and shoes and to place leather smoothly on lasts.

Another case where a Lascar had a European name appeared in a newspaper about a Lascar causing the death of another Lascar. The case gave the name of the assailant as John Sullivan, another unconventional name for a Lascar. It is likely that in this case he gave a false name or a name that was more British to get himself out of an unfavourable position.¹¹ Another example of misrepresented identity arises in an article entitled 'Death Sentence on Lascar,' where a Lascar seaman named Francisco Carlos Godhino was in court for the murder of Alice Emily Brewster.¹² Rozina Visram has suggested that there were instances where Lascars would have Portuguese-sounding names, like, Domingo Anthony, Emanuel Pardo (Parado), Anthony Sylva, Thomas Sylva, John Manuel, Joseph Domingo and Besantee Sylva.¹³

There is some means of guessing a person's ethnicity through the spelling of their name, as suggested by Bressey, however, this further demonstrates the caution that a researcher of minority communities must utilise when engaging with the archives.¹⁴ Overall, variations or misspellings of names and false names are common in archival content on Lascars, therefore this should be considered when researching.

Instances such as the fatal altercation in Liverpool in 1862 underscore the complexities of identifying Lascars within historical narratives, especially when relying on newspaper accounts prone to errors and misattributions. Furthermore, discrepancies in names complicate efforts to unravel the stories of minority communities and demonstrate the need for researchers to share their own experiences to help each other avoid interpretive pitfalls. While archival sources hold incredible value, they also have inherent shortcomings which could influence the methodology of scholars as they embark on research on minority communities and marginalised people.



Figure 2: Five Lascar seamen on board a Peninsular & Oriental Steam Navigation company cruise ship of the Ranpura class (1925). Royal Museums Greenwich.

Despite their significant presence, the process of tracing Lascars and minority communities within archival spaces is challenging.



- James W. Frey, Lascars, the Thames Police Court and the Old Bailey: Crime on the High Seas and the London Courts, 1852–8. Journal for Maritime Research, 16, 2011, 196–211.
- The Hackney Murder, Manchester Times - Saturday 06 April 1872, page 7.
- A Lascar, *Globe,* Friday 07 October 1853, page 4.
- 12. Death Sentence on a Lascar, Ballymena Weekly Telegraph, Saturday 16 September 1911, Page 10.

11.

13

- Rozina Visram, *Asians in Britain: 400 Years of History,* (Pluto Press, 2002), Page 23.
- Caroline Bressey, 'Invisible Presence: The Whitening of the Black Community in the Historical Imagination of British Archives', *Archivaria*, 61 (2006) 47-61.

14.



Figure 3: A lascar seaman holding the berthing rope of motor tender A from the Peninsular & Oriental Steam Navigation Company cruise ship Viceroy of India (1929) at Aandalsnes, Norway. Royal Museums Greenwich.

Discrepancies in names complicate efforts to unravel the stories of minority communities and demonstrate the need for researchers to share their own experiences

to help each other avoid interpretive pitfalls.⁹

25

'Reclaimed Lands':

Cultural Heritage and the Transformation of Post-War Poland's Western Territories



Figure 1: 'To the Oder, on the land of our forefathers and prosperity'. 1946 propaganda poster produced by the Ministry of the Reclaimed Lands. Source: Wikimedia Commons.

2

Joanna Konopińska, cited in Gregor Thum, trans. Tom Lampert and Allison Brown, Uprooted: How Breslau Became Wrocław during the Century of Expulsions (Princeton, 2011), p. 174. Between 1945 and 1949 around 4 million Polish settlers are estimated to have arrived in the new territories, while in nearly the same period (1944-1949) around 7.5 million German left the region. See Hugo Service, Germans to Poles (Cambridge, 2013), pp. 148-149.

3

of Lviv

in the city of Wrocław sits at her desk, finishing an entry in her diary. 'I should probably start putting the apartment in order', she writes, but the tidying she has in mind is of a very different sort to the kind we might imagine. 'Instead of writing', she says, 'I should be rushing about with a broom and a dust rag...cleaning and sweeping the foreignness out, the Germanness that emanates from every corner. Right now with every step I take I stumble across other people's things, evidence of a life I know nothing about, of the people who built this house and who may very well be dead. How does one start a life here? Impossible. I can't imagine that I'll ever be able to say that this is my house."

October 1945. A young Polish woman

Only a few months before, Wrocław had been a German city called Breslau, and our diarist was one of millions of Poles who-following the post-war Polish state's territorial shift westward-migrated to the formerly German regions that now lay within its frontiers.² Across a wide swathe of land stretching down from the Baltic coast to the Sudeten mountains, 1945 marked the beginning of a far-reaching process of cultural transformation. What was once German had to be made Polish, andas the words of our diarist suggestfor many Polish immigrants arriving in the new territories in Pomerania. Silesia, Warmia and Masuria, the experience of resettlement was coloured by a profound sense of

The city lay in the eastern

borderlands of the pre-war Polish

annexed by the Soviet Union after

state, territory that was subsequently

the war. Today it is the Ukrainian city



Maksymilian Loth-Hill

Maksymilian Loth-Hill is a Teaching Fellow in modern European history at Durham University, where he recently defended his PhD thesis on museology and the politics of culture in Stalinist Poland. His primary specialism is the cultural history of modern East-Central Europe, but he has a wide range of research interests including memory studies, East-Central European nationalism, borderland studies, museology, and public history.

dislocation and alienation. A popular saying of the time— 'jedna bomba atomowa i wrócimy znów do Lwowa' ('one atom bomb and we'll return again to Lwów'³)—reflected the fatalistic and uncertain atmosphere of those early post-war years, and settlers were said to be 'sitting on suitcases', waiting for a chance to leave the region for their homes in the lands to the east.⁴

For Poland's Soviet-backed rulers, however, it was imperative that the new territories be incorporated as soon as possible, and the symptoms of what one scholar has termed 'the impermanence syndrome' be swiftly assuaged.⁵ In contrast to the war-ravaged landscapes that many settlers encountered, propaganda presented the poniemieckie ('post-German') regions as a land of opportunity; 'to the Oder⁶', proclaimed one typical poster from 1946, 'the land of our forefathers and prosperity' (Fig. 1). As the slogan implies, history provided a key means of legitimating post-war geo-political reality. In official discourse of the late 1940s, the new territory was known as the Ziemie Odzyskane ('Reclaimed Lands')⁷, which, observes Marta Grzechnik, constituted a 'narrative in itself'.⁸ The argument being made drew heavily on the intellectual tradition of mvśl zachodnia (Western Thought)-the Polish counterpart to German Ostforschung (Eastern Research)-which was generally associated with the pre-war political right. Just as the latter was used to justify German rule in the east, the former sought to provide a scholarly foundation for Polish territorial claims in the west. By projecting ideas about 'national' character back into the distant past, it asserted that these were historically Polish lands, their true nature obscured through centuries of German imperialism.⁹ In this way, Western Thought helped present the territorial changes decided at the Yalta and Potsdam conferences as the 'righting' of a historical 'wrong', rather than the products of superpower Realpolitik.

Few scholars today would seriously argue that modern ethno-nationalist identities should be ascribed to the prehistoric peoples and early medieval polities lionised by the adherents of Western Thought. Nonetheless, such thinking played an important role in the 're-Polonisation'¹⁰ of the 'Reclaimed Lands' during the post-war years. In my doctoral research, I have explored this process from the perspective of the region's museums, which—as sites where 'place is formed into embodied historiography and material for identity construction'—were integral to the production of a Polono-centric vision of the past.¹¹

Such narratives could most clearly be seen in the flagship institutions established in Wrocław, Gdańsk and Szczecin (previously Breslau, Danzig, and Stettin respectively), the regional capitals of the 'Reclaimed Lands'. By the mid-1950s, for example, a visitor to Wrocław's Silesian Museum could take in a broad epoch-spanning panorama of the region's history, which began with the evolution of *Homo Sapiens* and concluded with Silesia's 'return to the motherland' in 1945. Though much of its



Figure 2: Tomb of the Silesian Piast duke Henry IV in what is today the National Museum in Wrocław (known before 1970 as the Silesian Museum). Source: Wikimedia Commons.

8

9.

 Marek Ordylowski, 'Nastroje mieszkańców Wrocławia w latach 1945-1946', *Dzieje Najnowsze*, Vol. 37, No. 4 (2005), p. 144. Of course, for those whose homes lay in what was now Soviet territory this was impossible.

Thum, *Uprooted, pp. 171–189.*

5

- 6. The river roughly marked part of the new western border.
- Though the term was dropped from official usage at the end of the 1940s, it continued in popular circulation for some time afterwards

Marta Grzechnik, "Recovering' Territories: The Use of History in the Integration of the New Polish Western Borderland after World War II', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 69, No. 4 (2017), p. 688.

p of artefacts salvaged from Ibid., pp. 674-675. pre-war German institutions, the museum's displays reinterpreted them to fit within a story that emphasised Silesia's age-old *polskość* ('Polishness'). Starting in the museum's 'Prehistory of Silesia' exhibition, visitors could learn about the presence of a 'proto-Slavic' population which 'proclaimed [Silesia's] cultural unity with the rest of [the] Polish lands'.¹² This linear narrative continued in subsequent galleries, with particular emphasis placed on the role of the medieval Piast dynasty, Silesia's one-time rulers, and the tombs of the Silesian Piast dukes Henry II (1196-1241) and (Fig. 2) Henry IV (c. 1258-1290) provided two of the museum's most important exhibits.¹³

The opening of the Silesian Museum¹⁴ in 1948 coincided with the staging of a massive propagandistic spectacle in Wrocław, the Wystawa Ziem Odzyskanych (Exhibition of the Reclaimed Lands), which was attended by around one-and-a-half million people from across Poland and beyond.¹⁵ Yet while its displays offered an optimistic vision of the region's putatively complete 're-Polonisation', the cultural *odniemczanie* ('de-Germanisation') of Poland's new territories involved much more than the construction of Polono-centric interpretations of the area's past.¹⁶ Alongside the mass expulsion of the German population, erasing 'German traces' also meant the removal of a vast volume of cultural heritage deemed problematic by the region's new rulers.¹⁷ A memorandum issued by the Chief Directorate of Museums and Protection of Monuments in August 1947 justified the removal of museum objects on the basis that they would be given 'necessary protective treatments' in Warsaw, but also stated that, for political reasons, items described as being 'tendentiously collected...by the Germans to demonstrate...Germanic culture in the areas of Silesia, Pomerania and Masuria' would not be returned.18

Though it went on to say that the Ministry of Culture and Art would 'not allow the Reclaimed Lands to become impoverished in terms of their possession of cultural artefacts', the impact of these measures was felt particularly keenly in smaller local museums—the former German *Heimatmuseen* of provincial towns.¹⁹ Already the victims of opportunistic looting in the immediate post-war period, until the 1950s the former *Heimatmuseen* received little attention from the central cultural administration beyond the partial stripping of their collections. With the

13



Figure 3: Poster for the 1948 Exhibition of the Reclaimed Lands in Wrocław. Note how the imagined Slavic totem incorporates layers of history, with the Piast eagle in the middle and the Polish one at the top. The names of the Oder and Neisse rivers in the background evoke the line of the new frontier. Source: Wikimedia Commons.

nationalisation of all Polish museums at the start of 1950, however, the issue of 'unsatisfactory' interpretation in the *Heimatmuseen* began to be seriously addressed. Indeed, as late as 1949 complaints were being made that these museums still presented a German picture of the region's past. In the Pomeranian town of Koszalin (formerly German Köslin), for example, an investigation launched by the local communist party apparatus concluded that,

- Though strictly speaking the term should be 'Polonisation', the narrative of the 'Reclaimed Lands' meant framing the process as one of restoration.
- Christopher Whitehead, Susannah Eckersley, Katherine Lloyd and Rhiannon Mason, 'Place, identity and migration and European museums', in Christopher Whitehead, Susannah Eckersley, Katherine Lloyd and Rhiannon Mason, eds., Museums, Migration and Identity in Europe: Peoples, Places and Identities (Abingdon, 2016), p. 15.
- Wanda Sarnowska, Śląsk Starożytny i Wczesnośredniowieczny – Przewodnik po Wystawie Archeologicznej Muzeum Śląskiego we Wrocławiu (Wrocław, 1954), p. 3.
 - The tombs themselves were empty, as the bodies had been removed by the Nazis as part of an attempt to prove that the Piasts were actually an 'Aryan' dynasty.
- 14. For the first two years of its existence it was known as the State Museum in Wrocław.
- J. Tyszkiewicz, Sto Wielkich Dni Wrocławia: Wystawa Ziem Odzyskanych we Wrocławiu a Propaganda Polityczna Ziem Zachodnich i Północnych w Latach 1945-1948 (Wrocław, 1997), p. 136.
- 16. Ibid., p. 53.
- For more detail on this process of cultural 'cleansing', see Service, *Germans to Poles*, pp. 266-274, and Thum, *Uprooted*, pp. 244-287.

beyond the museum's sign, little had changed since German times, remarking disdainfully that its displays left 'the working masses...free to explore Germanness during opening hours'.²⁰

Centralisation, however, resulted in the production of new museological narratives which sought to interpret the collections of the Heimatmuseen through a Polish nationalist lens. As Alon Confino has noted, these museums originated in Wilhelmine Germany as a 'mode of communication to reconcile localness and nationhood'; made up of the stuff of everyday life, they acted as a repository of traditions bridging past and present.²¹ Under Polish rule, they continued to function in this way, but the local past was reframed as Polish rather than German. In Jelenia Góra (German Hirschberg), for instance, a replica peasant cottage built by völkisch-konservative German Heimatlers in the early twentieth century was now presented as a typically Polish dwelling, while curators emphasised apparent similarities between collections of regional costumes and traditional clothing from Mazovia in east-central Poland.²² In this way, existing collections could be put to use in the service of a different 'imagined community'23, Polonising the local past to foster a sense of belonging among the town's new inhabitants.

In the short term, these interpretations played an important role, but, over time, they would gradually fade away. By the early 1970s, a new generation born in the western territories had come of age, and-with West German chancellor Willy Brandt's Ostpolitik promoting more conciliatory Polish-German relations-grand epochspanning narratives of *polskość* fell out of style. It was no longer necessary to stress the region's 'Polishness' quite so forcefully, and the large museums in Wrocław, Gdańsk and Szczecin began to look much more like typical art-historical 'universal survey' institutions; between 1970 and 1972 all three were given the title of 'National Museum'. Meanwhile, in the former *Heimatmuseen*, the collapse of communism in 1989 reawakened interest in the German past, previously a taboo subject. Ahistorical nationalism was a symptom of post-war territorial instability, and the fact that local museums across the region today present the histories of their communities in ways that move beyond binary Polish and German nationalist interpretations reflects the transformation of a once-contested borderland into an integral part of the Polish state. As the words of the diary entry with which we started show, however, in the immediate post-war years that was an outcome that seemed far from certain, and it was only through the development of a sense of belonging-underpinned by historical myth-making-that it became possible.



Figure 4: Interior of the reconstructed peasant cottage at the Heimatmuseum in Hirschberg (after 1945 Jelenia Góra), before the Second World War. After the war the cottage was left unchanged, but reinterpreted as an authentically 'Polish' dwelling. Source: collection of the Muzeum Karkonoskie in Jelenia Góra, courtesy of Robert Rzeszowski.

- Memorandum on the issue of museums in the 'Reclaimed Lands', Archiwum Akt Nowych (Central Archive of Modern Records, Warsaw) 196/79, p. 112.
- 19. Ibid., p. 113.
- Copy of the protocol from the inspection carried out in the Municipal Museum in Koszalin on February 21, 1949, Archiwum Państwowe w

Koszalinie (State Archive in Koszalin) 17/0/2/87, pp. 5-7.

- Alon Confino, The Nation as a Local Metaphor: Württemberg, Imperial Germany and National Memory, 1871-1918 (Chapel Hill; London, 1997), pp. 136-137.
- 22. Plan of the text for guiding around the main exhibition in the Museum in Jelenia Góra, 1954, *Archiwum*

Państwowe we Wrocławiu Oddział w Jeleniej Górze (State Archive in Wrocław, Department in Jelenia Góra) 83/168/9, pp. 111-112.

 The phrase is famously Benedict Anderson's. See his seminal work (first published in 1983), *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London; New York, 2006).

30 SYMEON | Issue Fourteen

Deconstructing 'Marital Race' Theory and Demystifying Boundaries Through the Gurkha Justice Campaign



Rachal Limbu

Rachal, a third-year undergraduate history student at Durham University, was drawn to Gurkha history by her familial ties. With both her father and great-grandfathers having served as Gurkhas in significant conflicts within the British Indian and British Army, she embarked on a dissertation journey. Her research delved into the portrayals of Gurkhas in literature through the prism of 'martial race' theory. Through her work, Rachal aimed to uncover the disparities and shed light on how these portrayals have influenced the lives of Gurkha soldiers, both during their service and in retirement.

Gurkhas have served in the British Army for over two centuries, participating in conflicts spanning from the two World Wars to recent engagements in the Falklands, The Gulf, Afghanistan, and Iraq. The term 'Gurkha' stems from 'Gorkha,' denoting individuals from the Kingdom of Gorkha, established by Prithvi Narayan Shah (1742-1775), who unified diverse ethnic groups during its conquest of Nepal in 1769.¹ British officers see Gurkhas as the descendants of these fighting men who conquered Kathmandu and made it their capital in 1765.²

The connection between Gurkhas and the British Army traces back to the Anglo-Nepalese War (1814-1815), a conflict between Nepal and the East India Company (EIC) over territorial claims in northern India. The EIC triumphed, expanding its territories, and subsequently



Figure 1: Field Marshall Wavell (centre), the viceroy of India, inspecting the 8th Gurkha Rifles, December 1945. Image courtesy of National Army Museum.

recruited Gurkhas due to their impressive fighting abilities. The Gurkha's reputation was solidified during the Indian Mutiny (1857-1859), where they were recognised as a superior 'martial race'.³ Teiimala Gurung defined the 'martial race' as a colonial construct based on the notion that certain groups are inherently predisposed to warfare.⁴ British officials categorised castes into 'martial' and 'nonmartial' groups, leading to discourses that prioritised recruiting 'pure Gurkhas'.⁵ Gurungs, Magars, Limbus, and Rais were from the Tibet-Burman language groups and comprised the early Gurkhas and were labelled as 'martial race' tribes.⁶ With little political representation since the eighteenth century, the British heavily recruited these groups, believing their military skills were superior, particularly due to their origins in challenging mountainous terrains and illiteracy, which British officers thought would guarantee loyalty.7

Even though Gurkhas have served alongside the British in every significant conflict, few studies have explored the conditions and sentiments of Gurkhas engaged in conflicts far from their homeland. This sentiment extends beyond the Gurkhas and to their families, who grappled with the heart-wrenching possibility of never reuniting with their loved ones-husbands, sons, and brotherswho were fighting in distant lands. During WWI and II, approximately 210,000 Gurkhas served, resulting in over 40,000 casualties and 15,000 deaths.⁸ Amidst these losses, Gurkhas and their families exhibited extraordinary resilience. By interpreting the misrepresentation of Gurkhas in nineteenth-century discourses, this article will broaden the existing histories of Gurkha soldiers and their growing voices in the twenty-first century following their movement to the UK.

Unlike their predecessors, contemporary Gurkhas are more outspoken about their experiences with unequal treatment in the military and are frequently featured in media and interviews. However, this does not imply that previous generations were silent; rather, their voices were obscured by colonial boundaries placed on them that reduced them to a subordinate role of a mere mercenary. Other factors such as illiteracy. lack of modern communication tools and the physical separation between mainland Britain and themselves have made it difficult for Gurkhas veteran to voice their grievances. The Gurkha Justice Campaign (GJC) has been pivotal in spotlighting historical levels of disparity in the treatment of Gurkhas compared to their British counterparts. More specifically, Gurkha activism has successfully broken down physical and conceptual barriers imposed by 'martial race' theory, which has historically misrepresented them and their interests.



Early Gurkha historiography has been shaped by British officers since the nineteenth century. These narratives emphasise the inherent martial prowess of Gurkhas, largely influenced by the 'martial race' theory.

This occurred as early as 1833 through Brian Hodgson's research advocating for increased Gurkha recruitment from 'military tribes.'⁹ This continued into the 1980s with ex-British officers writing regimental histories. Byron Farwell's *The Gurkhas* (1984) emphasised Gurkha bravery and their special bond with British officers, widely accepted as accurate portrayals of Gurkha history and character.

- Carina A. Montgomery, The Gurkhas and Colonial Knowledge: Habitat, Masculinity and the Making of a Martial Race, C. 1760-1830 (National Library of Canada, 1999), p. 1.
- Lionel Caplan, "Bravest of the Brave': Representations of 'The Gurkha 'in British Military Writings." *Modern Asian Studies*25, no. 3 (1991), p. 571.
- Heather Streets, Martial Races: The Military, Race and Masculinity in British Imperial Culture, 1857-1914 (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2004), p. 76.

3.

- Tejimala Gurung, "The making of Gurkhas as a 'Martial Race' in Colonial India: Theory and Practice' in *Proceedings of the Indian History Congress*, vol. 75, pp. 520-529 (Indian History Congress, 2014). p. 520.
- Caplan, Lionel. Warrior gentlemen: 'Gurkhas' in the western imagination (Berghahn Books, 1995), p. 27

lbid., p. 54. Ibid.

6

"Gurkhas and the First World War." *The Gurkha Museum*, January 6, 2021, available at: <u>https://thegurkhamuseum.co.uk/blog/</u> <u>gurkhas-and-the-first-world-war/_</u>(accessed 10 October 2023). However, in the 1990s, anthropologists started integrating Gurkha interviews into their research on ethnic communities in Nepal. Whilst conducting fieldwork in Ilam in eastern Nepal, home to many Limbus, Lionel Caplan noted a significant disparity between ex-Gurkha soldiers and their portraval in military literature. Caplan's. Warrior Gentlemen (1995) challenged the dominant Gurkha 'martial race' theory, arguing it was a product of 'Western imagination', highlighting their misrepresentation in Western literature.¹⁰ Similarly, scholars like Heather Street and Carina Montgomery examined the codification of the 'martial race' theory following the Indian Mutiny.¹¹

In the past decade, there has been a surge in insightful works that explore Gurkhas beyond the limitations of 'martial race' theory, which has developed from Mary Des Chene's contextualization of Gurkha historiography within a post-colonial framework. By emphasising the role of history, race, character, and environment in shaping 'martial race' theory in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, Des Chene highlighted British officers' preference for highland 'tribes,' believing they were untouched by civilization.¹² This led to stereotypes of the 'simple-minded' and 'child-like' Gurkhas, as the British sought to recruit illiterate and 'rustic' individuals.13 These perceptions stemmed from the historical marginalisation of ethnic groups in Nepal, deprived of education by higher-caste Brahmins. Pratyoush Onta builds on this, arguing there is a direct link between the discriminatory policies highlighted by the GJC and the 'martial race' theory created by the British.¹⁴ He uses the theme of 'dukha' (hardship) to underscore the exclusion of Gurkhas from Nepal's national history and their marginalisation within the British Army. Mitra Pariyar synthesises these historiographies, examining how recent Gurkha migration to the UK has empowered Gurkha veterans to advocate for their rights.¹⁵ Thus, by integrating insights from the GJC and Gurkha movement, newer scholarship has dismantled the conceptual boundaries imposed by the 'martial race' theory alongside the GJC.



The GJC was ignited in 2004 when the Labour government announced that from 2007. Gurkhas who had served for over four vears would be allowed to settle in the UK with their families after their retirement.

12.

13.

Although many Gurkhas were granted settlement rights, those who retired before the Handover of Hong Kong in July 1997 were excluded. The handover was significant not just because it marked the end of an era of British colonial presence in the region, but it led to the disbanding of the Gurkha regiment, which had been stationed there since Indian Independence. The handover raised concerns among Gurkhas about their future deployment and service conditions as many were made redundant, made to return home, and look for a second career while still in the prime of their working lives ¹⁶

Unhappy with their mistreatment, those who had retired before 1997 organised the GJC and took their protest to mainland Britain. Led predominantly by Gurkha veterans, it debunked myths and exposed the difficulties of their military service. The GJC was extremely successful in highlighting the discrepancies between pay, pensions, welfare, and settlement rights.¹⁷ Gurkha protestors wielded their military history to negotiate with the British government, highlighting their sense of injustice over settlement rights and appeared before the British public and media. Adorned in smart attire the Daily Mirror captured Gurkhas 'wearing poppies and campaign medals and carrying banners flocked to the High Court'.¹⁸ Therefore, the GJC played a pivotal role in amplifying Gurkhas' voices, challenging prevailing narratives surrounding their treatment within the military.

The success of the GJC has been significant in showcasing Gurkhas were no longer foreign soldiers far removed from the British public and politics. Evidence of this could be seen on April 29th 2009, when the Liberal Democrats presented a motion in the House of Commons advocating for the settlement of pre-1997 Gurkhas. The motion passed with 267 votes, including support from twenty-eight MPs of the ruling Labour Party.¹⁹ Although non-binding, this vote dealt a significant blow to the Labour government, leading them to announce on May 21 that all ex-Gurkhas with four or more years of service would be permitted to settle in the UK.20

Moreover, the GJC fostered support and empathy from the British public, and aided the integration of the Gurkhas and their families by promoting a welcoming environment for Gurkhas who were perceived as 'deserving immigrants.'21 A reader's letter to The BIG issue said, 'How shameful that such fearless and dignified men should have been forced to resort to the legal process to obtain what should have been given freely.²² By delving into Gurkha history beyond conventional narratives, the GJC's triumph in challenging the nineteenth-century 'martial race' theory and advocating for equality shows a recent example of historically marginalised groups breaking the physical boundaries imposed on them.

- Brian H. Hodgson, "Origin and classification 9. of the military tribes of Nepal." Journal of Asiatic Society of Bengal 2 (1833), p. 218.
- Caplan, Lionel, Warrior gentlemen: 'Gurkhas in the western, p. 150
- See Carina A. Montgomery, The Gurkhas and Colonial Knowledge: Habitat, Masculinity and the Making of a Martial Race, C. 1760-1830.

(1999), p. 125. Ibid., p. 124.

Pratyoush Raj Onta, The Politics of Bravery: 14. A History of Nepali Nationalism (University of Pennsylvania, 1996), p. 22.

Mary Des Chene, "Military Ethnology in

British India." South Asia Research 19, no. 2

- 15. Mitra Pariyar, "Caste, military, migration: Nepali Gurkha communities in Britain." Ethnicities 20, no. 3 (2020), p. 618,
- Che Singh Kochhar George, "Nepalese Gurkhas and Their Battle for Equal Rights." Race & class 52, no. 2 (2010), p. 49.
- 17 Saniay Sharma, "Mere "Mercenaries" to Equal Citizens: Political and Social Negotiations by Gurkhas in the UK," (PhD diss., Central European University, 2017), p. 27.
- Andrew Gregory, "ONE BIG STEP TO 18. JUSTICE: GURKHAS FIGHT FOR RIGHTS IN COURT 1." The Daily Mirror, October 28, 2009. at:http://ezphost.dur.ac.uk/login?url=https:// www.proquest.com/newspapers/ one-big-stepjustice/docview/340794336/se2 (accessed 10 October 2023)
- Andrew Sparrow, "Defeat for Gordon Brown over Gurkhas," The Guardian, April 29, 2009
- Figure 3: Gurkha Protest at Albert Square, Manchester, 23 September 2008 (Peter Birkinshaw).
 - 20. Ibid. Anju Gurung, "Gurkha Diaspora Contribution 21. In Nepal-UK Diplomatic Relationship." (PhD diss., Department of International Relation & Diplomacy, 2019), p. 67.
- Win Overdue: [1]." The Daily Mirror, October 6. 2008. at: http://ezphost.dur.ac.uk/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/newspapers/letter-big-issue-gurkha-win-overdue/ docview/340489444/se-2, (accessed 10 October 2023)



Whilst Gurkha service in the British Military spotlights the indelible mark colonialism has left historically on marginalised communities, the GJC showcased how groups can leverage historical narratives around their bravery

and lovalty to assert their citizenship rights and foster a sense of belonging. The GJC has shattered the physical boundaries imposed by 'martial race' theory, exposing historical inequalities within the British Army, and successfully advocating for settlement rights for Gurkhas and their families. This movement, alongside emerging historiography, has been instrumental in deconstructing conceptual boundaries, granting Gurkhas a platform to challenge stereotypes, advocate for their rights, and share their stories, thus undermining notions of blind loyalty and subordination from the nineteenth century.



Figure 2: Gurkha Justice Campaign rally, Westminster, 21 May 2009.

How shameful that such fearless and dignified men should have been forced to resort to the legal process to obtain what should have been given freely.



22. M. Williams, "Letter: The BIG Issue - Gurkha

Careers event for postgraduate and early career historians



Sarah Davies

Sarah Davies is a cultural historian of the Soviet Union and the Cold War. Her first book, Popular Opinion in Stalin's Russia (CUP, 1997) was awarded the Alec Nove prize. Her current project is a study of Soviet and British cultural diplomacy during the Cold War.

The department recently held its first ever careers event aimed specifically at postgraduate and early career historians. We recognise that while some people undertake a postgraduate History degree in the hope of eventually pursuing an academic career, the academic job market is always very tight - no more so than at the present when University finances are under huge pressure. Other postgraduates are not intending to become academics and regard MAs and PhDs as a route into other careers. This event was designed to introduce people to a range of jobs for which a postgraduate degree in History might be a particular asset.

We were delighted to welcome seven fantastic speakers to the event on May 3rd. All have History PhDs from Durham or other universities and have gone on to work in careers





Figure 2: Photo courtesy of Sarah Davies.

ranging from the civil service to publishing. They talked about how employers value the PhD and how it sets them apart from other job candidates. They discussed the various ways in which the skills they acquired in their PhDs had helped them, such as the ability to digest and analyse large quantities of information and work independently. They provided fascinating insights into the jobs themselves, including a 'typical' day.

Matt Greenhall, who is currently Director of Libraries, Museums and Galleries at the University of Liverpool, spoke about his career which started at Durham University's Museums and Heritage Collections following a PhD in History at Durham. Ellen Crabtree, Vice Principal of University College, Durham explained how her doctorate led to a job in university administration, conveying her enthusiasm for working with Castle students and the wider college community. Sarah Price talked about her nearly 30-year career in the cultural sector. She is currently head of the fabulous Locomotion railway museum down the road at Shildon, home to the largest undercover display of heritage rail vehicles in Europe. Beth Brewer, who completed her PhD at Durham early last year, spoke about her current job as a social researcher at the Department for Energy Security and Net Zero and her exciting new post working for the Cabinet Office on the Covid Inquiry. Joe Kelly, who works in academic publishing, demonstrated how a PhD in History can open doors to very different disciplines: he is currently the Publishing Operations Lead at the Microbiology Society. Mike Ashby discussed his very varied civil service career, which has included posts in the Department of Business and Trade and HM Treasury. Finally, Simon Henderson gave us an entertaining insight into his job as a teacher of History at Teesdale School in Barnard Castle, where he is Deputy Head and Head of Sixth Form. We are hugely grateful to all the speakers for giving up their time to talk to our students and early career scholars. Everyone came away inspired by their stories about life and work outside the Ivory Tower and excited about the potential opportunities open to those with postgraduate degrees in History. We hope to organise similar events for both postgraduates and undergraduates in the future and would love to hear from any alumni who would be willing to take part.



They discussed the various ways in which the skills they acquired in their PhDs had helped them, such as the ability to digest and analyse large quantities of information and work independently.





Figure 4: Photo courtesy of Sarah Davies.



Everyone came away inspired by their stories about life and work outside the Ivory Tower and excited about the potential opportunities open to those with postgraduate degrees in History.



Figure 3: Photo courtesy of Sarah Davies.



Contact us

We hope you have enjoyed the fourteenth issue of Symeon. We would like to include more about you, our alumni, in subsequent issues, so please get in touch and let us know what you are doing now. Whether you have a job related to history and the skills you developed during your study in the department or you have moved on to something entirely different, we would love to hear from you! We would also be delighted to hear your thoughts on Symeon. Perhaps you have ideas for future articles or subject areas you would like us to cover. You might even consider contributing an article yourself. We would be thrilled to have your thoughts.

Please write to us at: Symeon Magazine Department of History 43 North Bailey Durham DH1 3EX

Join our Facebook group: 'Durham University History Alumni'

or follow us on Twitter: @SymeonMagazine

We hope you enjoyed Issue Fourteen. Until next time!

SYMEON

——Issue Fourteen——

The magazine for Alumni. Department of History, Durham University.

2024